

#### UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

REGION 5 77 WEST JACKSON BOULEVARD CHICAGO, IL 60604-3590

December 15, 2008

REPLY TO THE ATTENTION OF:

LC-8J

<u>CERTIFIED MAIL</u> Receipt No. 7001 0320 0005 8931 8151

Mr. Max E. Dehn, Esquire Cavitch, Familo, Durkin & Frutkin 1717 East Ninth Street, 14<sup>th</sup> Floor Cleveland, Ohio 44114

Consent Agreement and Final Order, Docket No.EPCRA-052008-0005

Dear Mr. Dehn:

Enclosed is a copy of a fully executed Consent Agreement and Final Order in resolution of the above case. This document was filed on December 15, 2008, with the Regional Hearing Clerk.

The civil penalty in the amount of \$15,345 is to be paid in the manner described in paragraph 10 and 11. In the comment or description field of the electronic funds transfer, please state: Libra Industries, Inc., the docket number of this CAFO (above), and the following billing document number <a href="mailto:bb 2750944E007">BD 2750944E007</a>. Payment is due by January 14, 2009, (within 30 calendar days of the filing date).

Thank you for your cooperation in resolving this matter.

Sincerely,

Robert Allen

Pesticides and Toxics Compliance Section

REGIONAL HEARING CLERK U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

Enclosures

# UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION 5

In the Matter of:	) Docket No. EPCRA-05-2008-0005
Libra Industries, Inc. Mentor, Ohio,	<ul> <li>) Proceeding to Assess a Civil Penalty Under</li> <li>) Section 325(c) of the Emergency Planning</li> <li>) and Community Right-to-Know Act of</li> </ul>
Respondent.	) 1986, 42 U.S.C. § 11045(c)
Conser	t Agreement and Final Order  DEC 1 5 2008

### **Preliminary Statement**

REGIONAL HEARING CLES DITECT STATES VIRONMENTAL

- 1. Complainant, the Director of the Land and Chemicals Division, United States
  Environmental Protection Agency (U.S. EPA), Region 5, brought this administrative action
  seeking a civil penalty under Section 325(c) of the Emergency Planning and Community Rightto-Know Act of 1986 (EPCRA), 42 U.S.C. § 11045(c).
- 2. On January 3, 2008, U.S. EPA filed the Complaint in this action against Respondent Libra Industries, Inc. The Complaint alleges that in 2004, Respondent processed lead at its Mentor, Ohio, facility in quantities exceeding the threshold for reporting under Section 313(f) of EPCRA, 42 U.S.C. § 11023(f), and that Respondent violated Section 313 of EPCRA and 40 C.F.R. Part 372 by failing to submit Toxic Chemical Release Inventory Reporting Forms (Form R) for lead by July 1 2005, for calendar year 2004.
- 3. Respondent filed an Answer and requested a hearing under Section 325(c) of EPCRA, 42 U.S.C. § 11045(c), and 40 C.F.R. § 22.15.

#### **Stipulations**

4. Respondent admits the jurisdictional allegations in the Complaint and denies the factual allegations in the Complaint, other than those it admitted in its Answer.

- 5. Respondent waives any right to contest the allegations in the Complaint and its right to appeal this Consent Agreement and Final Order (CAFO).
  - 6. Respondent certifies that it is complying fully with EPCRA.
- 7. Respondent consents to the assessment of the civil penalty specified in this CAFO and to the terms of this CAFO.
- 8. The parties agree that settling this action without further litigation, upon the terms in this CAFO, is in the public interest.

#### **Civil Penalties**

- 9. In consideration of Respondent's cooperation and its good faith efforts to comply, U.S. EPA agrees to mitigate the proposed penalty of \$21,922 to \$15,345.
- 10. By January 16, 2009, Respondent must pay the \$15,345 civil penalty by sending a cashier's or certified check, payable to the "Treasurer, United States of America," to:

U.S. EPA
Fines and Penalties
Cincinnati Finance Center
P.O. Box 979077
St. Louis, MO 63197-9000

The check must note the case title, the docket number of this CAFO, and the billing document number.

11. A transmittal letter, stating Respondent's name, complete address, the case title, the case docket number, and the billing document number must accompany the payment.

Respondent must send a copy of the check and transmittal letter to:

Regional Hearing Clerk (E-13J) U.S. EPA, Region 5 77 W. Jackson Blvd. Chicago, IL 60604 Robert Allen (LC-8J)
Pesticides and Toxics Compliance Section
U.S. EPA, Region 5
77 W. Jackson Blvd.
Chicago, IL 60604

Ann Coyle (C-14J)
Office of Regional Counsel
U.S. EPA, Region 5
77 W. Jackson Blvd.
Chicago, IL 60604

- 12. This civil penalty is not deductible for federal tax purposes.
- 13. If Respondent does not pay the civil penalty timely, U.S. EPA may bring an action to collect any unpaid portion of the penalty with interest, handling charges, nonpayment penalties, and the United States' enforcement expenses for the collection action. The validity, amount, and appropriateness of the civil penalty are not reviewable in a collection action.
- 14. Pursuant to 31 C.F.R. § 901.9, Respondent must pay the following on any amount overdue under this CAFO. Interest will accrue on any amount overdue from the date the payment was due at a rate established by the Secretary of the Treasury. Respondent must pay a \$15 handling charge each month that any portion of the penalty is more than 30 days past due. In addition, Respondent must pay a 6 percent per year penalty on any principal amount 90 days past due.

#### **General Provisions**

- 15. This CAFO resolves only Respondent's liability for federal civil penalties for the violations alleged in the Complaint.
- 16. This CAFO does not affect the right of U.S. EPA or the United States to pursue appropriate injunctive or other equitable relief or criminal sanctions for any violation of law.
  - 17. This CAFO does not affect Respondent's responsibility to comply with EPCRA and

other applicable federal, state, and local laws.

- 18. This CAFO is a "final order" for purposes of U.S. EPA's Enforcement Response Policy for Section 313 of EPCRA.
  - 19. The terms of this CAFO bind Respondent, its successors, and assigns.
- 20. Each person signing this agreement certifies that he or she has the authority to sign for the party whom he or she represents and to bind that party to its terms.
  - 21. Each party agrees to bear its own costs and attorney's fees in this action.
  - This CAFO constitutes the entire agreement between the parties.

Libra Industries, Inc., Respondent

Libra Industries, Inc.

United States Environmental Protection Agency, Complainant

Land and Chemicals Division

In the Matter of: Libra Industries, Inc. Docket No. EPCRA-05-2008-0005



## Final Order

REGIONAL HEARING CLERK
U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTE HOW AGENCY

This Consent Agreement and Final Order, as agreed to by the parties, shall become effective immediately upon filing with the Regional Hearing Clerk. This Final Order concludes this proceeding pursuant to 40 C.F.R. §§ 22.18 and 22.31. IT IS SO ORDERED.

Date 12/07

Lynn Buhl

Regional Administrator

United States Environmental Protection Agency

Region 5

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that the original signed copy of the Consent Agreement and Final Order in resolution of the civil administrative action involving Libra Industries, Inc., was filed on December 15, 2008, with the Regional Hearing Clerk (E-13J), U. S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 5, 77 West Jackson Boulevard, Chicago, Illinois 60604, and that I mailed, by Certified Mail, Receipt No. 7001 0320 0005 8931 8151 a copy of the original to the Respondent:

Mr. Max E. Dehn, Esquire Cavitch, Familo, Durkin & Frutkin 1717 East Ninth Street, 14<sup>th</sup> Floor Cleveland, Ohio 44114

and forwarded intra-Agency copies to:

Marcy Toney, Regional Judicial Officer, ORC/C-14J Ann Coyle, Counsel for Complainant/C-14J Eric Volck, Cincinnati Finance/MWD

Frederick Brown, PTCS (LC-8J)

U.S. EPA - Region 5

77 West Jackson Boulevard Chicago, Illinois 60604

Docket No. EPCRA-052008-0005

DEC 1 5 2008

REGIONAL HEARING CLERK
U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION AGENCY